

To: Kreisler, Eva[Kreisler.Eva@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Thur 10/6/2016 12:49:12 PM
Subject: RE: Declined: Meeting with Marianne Engelman Lado and Complainants re Pending OCR Case Involving NCDEQ and Swine Feeding Operations
OPTIONS FOR OTHER EPA ACTIONS TO HELP ADDRESS IMPACTS. 10.5.2016.docx

Eva-

Could you please have your CAFO experts take a look at these OneEPA options. These are things that EPA could do that might lead to improved conditions. OGC attys have written the big chunks of text about the statutory provisions.

Any comments on these options or any additional ones they can think of. Especially in the other options sections.

I'll need comments by midday tomorrow. They can send them to me individually, you don't need to collect them in one set of comments.

This will be part of the briefing materials for the meeting next Thursday. The other part OCR is reviewing now as it deals mostly with the investigation. It will be distributed to the people coming to the meeting -- I hope tomorrow.

I am heading out now, but will be in this afternoon & we can talk about yesterday & any questions you might have. Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone
Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
Office of General Counsel
US EPA
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460
(202) 564-4992

-----Original Message-----

From: Kreisler, Eva
Sent: Thursday, October 06, 2016 8:26 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>; Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>
Cc: Packard, Elise <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Declined: Meeting with Marianne Engelman Lado and Complainants re Pending OCR Case Involving NCDEQ and Swine Feeding Operations

Thank you Mary, I look forward to chatting with you later today.

Eva H. Kreisler, Senior Attorney
International Compliance Assurance Division U.S. EPA (2254A) Office (202) 564-8186
Fax (202) 564-0073
kreisler.eva@epa.gov

Help EPA fight pollution by reporting environmental violations on EPA's website at
<http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html>

This email, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and it may be protected by the attorney-client or other privileges. This email, including attachments, contains information that is intended to be conveyed only to the designated recipient(s).

-----Original Message-----

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Wednesday, October 05, 2016 10:36 PM
To: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Kreisler, Eva <Kreisler.Eva@epa.gov>
Cc: Packard, Elise <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Declined: Meeting with Marianne Engelman Lado and Complainants re Pending OCR Case Involving NCDEQ and Swine Feeding Operations

Lilian-
I can fill Eva in tomorrow afternoon.
The meeting is scheduled for the morning of the 13th.
I need to give her a draft of the OneEPA options to look at tomorrow as well so we can get the briefing materials out..

Mary O'Lone
Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
Office of General Counsel
US EPA
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460
(202) 564-4992

-----Original Message-----

From: Dorka, Lilian
Sent: Wednesday, October 05, 2016 10:04 PM
To: Kreisler, Eva <Kreisler.Eva@epa.gov>
Cc: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Declined: Meeting with Marianne Engelman Lado and Complainants re Pending OCR Case Involving NCDEQ and Swine Feeding Operations

Hi Eva, I understand. We can maybe set up a time to talk and can give you bottom line on today's meeting. As for the meeting next week, Avi has set that for Thursday at 11. I will forward that invite to you tomorrow.

Sent from my iPhone

> On Oct 5, 2016, at 1:21 PM, Kreisler, Eva <Kreisler.Eva@epa.gov> wrote:

>

> Hi Lilian,

>

> Unfortunately, I am unable to join this afternoon's call, **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**
> appointment. If there are any notes from the meeting I would appreciate getting them.

>

> Also, as far as the meeting next week is concerned, please note that the **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**
> is Tuesday and Wednesday next week so if the call could be on Thursday or Friday it would be much appreciated.

>

> Thank you,

>

> Eva

>

> <meeting.ics>

To: Fegley, Robert[Fegley.Robert@epa.gov]; Lackey, Leila[Lackey.Leila@epa.gov]
Cc: Flowers, Lynn[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov]; Isales, Daniel[Isales.Daniel@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Fri 1/6/2017 4:59:53 PM
Subject: RE: NEED YOUR ASSISTANCE WITH URGENT REVIEW OF DRAFT LETTER OF CONCERN TO NC DEQ RE HOG OPERATIONS CIVIL RIGHTS CASE

Great & thanks so much for that quick feedback.

Mary

Mary M. O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Fegley, Robert
Sent: Friday, January 06, 2017 11:57 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>; Lackey, Leila <Lackey.Leila@epa.gov>
Cc: Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Isales, Daniel <Isales.Daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: NEED YOUR ASSISTANCE WITH URGENT REVIEW OF DRAFT LETTER OF CONCERN TO NC DEQ RE HOG OPERATIONS CIVIL RIGHTS CASE

Leila is out today (and I am out next week), but I am currently trying to address the comments and will hand off to Leila on Monday.

On this specific issue, I went through this and suggest that you say something like “the essential aspects of the methodology” were the same or something like that. By necessity, there are aspects that are different (data sources for hog farm permits are not the same as well location

data in south Texas), so I don't think we can say (or imply) that it is exactly the same. But they used the same statistical approaches, which is the crux of the papers.

From: O'Lone, Mary

Sent: Friday, January 06, 2017 11:47 AM

To: Lackey, Leila <Lackey.Leila@epa.gov>

Cc: Fegley, Robert <Fegley.Robert@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Isales, Daniel <Isales.Daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: NEED YOUR ASSISTANCE WITH URGENT REVIEW OF DRAFT LETTER OF CONCERN TO NC DEQ RE HOG OPERATIONS CIVIL RIGHTS CASE

Importance: High

Leila-

I am flagging the next draft of the REACH letter for you b/c it contains a request or two for assistance from ORD.

I adopted ORD's comments on the previous draft. In response to one about whether Dr. Wing's disparity study been peer reviewed, I added some language and asked if you all could help with it. I am attaching copies of the studies for ease of reference.

Thanks, Mary

Mary M. O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Dorka, Lilian

Sent: Thursday, January 05, 2017 6:22 PM

To: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Robbins, Chris <Robbins.Chris@epa.gov>; Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>; Breen, Barry <Breen.Barry@epa.gov>

Cc: Garbow, Avi <Garbow.Avi@epa.gov>; Shenkman, Ethan <Shenkman.Ethan@epa.gov>; O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Lapierre, Kenneth <Lapierre.Kenneth@epa.gov>

Subject: NEED YOUR ASSISTANCE WITH URGENT REVIEW OF DRAFT LETTER OF CONCERN TO NC DEQ RE HOG OPERATIONS CIVIL RIGHTS CASE

Importance: High

Hello ORD, OECA, OW, OAR and OLEM Colleagues,

Happy new year and best wishes for 2017! Thank you all so much for all of the assistance you have already provided on this on this high priority case involving NC DEQ's administration of the swine feeding operations in their state. We are again asking for your assistance by way of urgent review of the attached "Letter of Concern" that we anticipate issuing next week. This draft already reflects comments/edits from OGC, DOJ, Region 4 and ORD.

ORD, thanks for your assistance in crafting some of the specific parts of this letter. We have a couple of follow up questions for you in the highlighted comment boxes. We are asking for the other program offices to please review this letter (and please see specifically the comment bubble on page 11) and provide any comments/question **by noon on Tuesday 1/10**. We very much appreciate your help! If you have any questions, please let me or Mary O'Lone know how we can help. Thanks so much!

Lilian

To: O'Lone, Mary[OLone.Mary@epa.gov]
From: Lackey, Leila
Sent: Tue 10/18/2016 1:25:04 PM
Subject: RE: Developing Next Steps in the Title VI REACH CAFOs Case (Call in number: 1-866-299-3188, Code: 564-1917)

Hi Mary,

Just making the connection after the meeting yesterday. I'm working with Fred Hauchman (ORD/OSP Office Director) to try to identify who in ORD can best provide assistance.

Best,
Leila

--

Air Team, EPA/ORD/OSP/PSS
Ronald Reagan Building, 51172
202.564.5957; lackey.leila@epa.gov

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hauchman, Fred **On Behalf Of** Garbow, Avi

Sent: Monday, October 17, 2016 11:55 AM

To: Lackey, Leila

Subject: FW: Developing Next Steps in the Title VI REACH CAFOs Case (Call in number: Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

When: Monday, October 17, 2016 4:30 PM-5:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: 4045

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Garbow, Avi

Sent: Monday, October 17, 2016 10:58 AM

To: Garbow, Avi; Hauchman, Fred; Fritz, Matthew; Pieh, Lusen; Dorka, Lilian; Isales, Daniel; Shaw, Betsy; Shapiro, Mike; Starfield, Lawrence; Lapierre, Kenneth; Packard, Elise; Shenkman, Ethan; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Breen, Barry; Prabhu, Aditi; Robbins, Chris

Cc: Heard, Anne; Wilkes, Mary; Tommelleo, Nancy; HALIM-CHESTNUT, NAIMA; McTeerToney, Heather; Jenkins, Brandi; Jones-Johnson, Shea; Giattina, James; Gordon, Scott; Srinivasan, Gautam; Nagle, Deborah; Frace, Sheila; Sawyers, Andrew; Frazer, Brian; Utting, George; Johnson, Johanna; Kupchan, Simma; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt; Covington, Jeryl; Molloy, Jennifer; Wilson, Shari; Akinnusotu, Bunmi; Tennessee, Denise; Hicks, Javoyne; Radtke, Meghan; Kreisler, Eva; Tejada, Matthew; Carleton, Ron; Sisario, Kelly

Subject: FW: Developing Next Steps in the Title VI REACH CAFOs Case (Call in number: Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

When: Monday, October 17, 2016 4:30 PM-5:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: 4045

Hi Fred,

Chris would like to know if your folks could cover this today? See attachments for more info.

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Garbow, Avi

Sent: Thursday, October 13, 2016 1:24 PM

To: Garbow, Avi; Fritz, Matthew; Pieh, Lusen; Dorka, Lilian; Isales, Daniel; Shaw, Betsy; Shapiro, Mike; Starfield, Lawrence; Lapierre, Kenneth; Packard, Elise; Shenkman, Ethan; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Breen, Barry; Prabhu, Aditi; Robbins, Chris

Cc: Heard, Anne; Wilkes, Mary; Tommelleo, Nancy; HALIM-CHESTNUT, NAIMA; McTeerToney, Heather; Jenkins, Brandi; Jones-Johnson, Shea; Giattina, James; Gordon, Scott; Srinivasan, Gautam; Nagle, Deborah; Frace, Sheila; Sawyers, Andrew; Frazer, Brian; Utting, George; Johnson, Johanna; Kupchan, Simma; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt; Covington, Jeryl; Molloy, Jennifer; Wilson, Shari; Akinnusotu, Bunmi; Tennessee, Denise; Hicks, Javoyne; Radtke, Meghan; Kreisler, Eva; Tejada, Matthew; Carleton, Ron; Sisario, Kelly

Subject: Developing Next Steps in the Title VI REACH CAFOs Case (Call in number: 1-

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

When: Monday, October 17, 2016 4:30 PM-5:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: 4045

<< File: 2016.10.17 Briefing ATT. C List of studies & reports 10.13.2016.docx >> << File: 2016.10.17 Briefing ATT. B Impact from declarations 10.13.2016.docx >> << File: 2016.10.17 Briefing ATT. A REACH complaint BACKGROUND timeline 10.13.2016.docx >> << File: 2016.10.17 Agenda REACH & NC CAFOs mtg.docx >> << File: 2016.10.17 Briefing paper Approach REACH & NC swine CAFOs 10.13.docx >> << File: 2016.10.17 Briefing ATT. D 09 03 14 Complaint - Exhibit 2 - Wing comments on Gen permit (2013).pdf >>

To: Wiedeman, Allison[Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Wed 5/11/2016 3:15:42 PM
Subject: RE: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

.....
>>>>>>

No problem.

Nope, you can just say OGC.

(because there are program attys in OCR, but I am not one of them).

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wiedeman, Allison
Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 10:52 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: RE: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

Thanks Mary for setting me straight on which attorney you are. Would I refer to you in shorthand as an OCR attorney?

Allison Wiedeman

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Chief, Rural Branch

Water Permits, Office of Water

Rm 7146 EPA East

Washington, D.C. 20460

202 564 0901

From: O'Lone, Mary

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 1:59 PM

To: Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>; Wood, Robert <Wood.Robert@epa.gov>; Southerland, Elizabeth <Southerland.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Behl, Betsy <Behl.Betsy@epa.gov>; Flaherty, Colleen <Flaherty.Colleen@epa.gov>; Hisel-Mccoy, Sara <Hisel-McCoy.Sara@epa.gov>; Washington, Evelyn <Washington.Evelyn@epa.gov>; Zipf, Lynn <Zipf.Lynn@epa.gov>

Cc: Tejada, Matthew <Tejada.Matthew@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Johnson, Johahna <Johnson.Johahna@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

Thanks Allison & Robert.

Robert is correct, OCR is mainly interested in OW's advice on the underlying studies about water impacts, rather than the proximity studies. (But if you have any thoughts about the proximity study or there is something that jumps out at you that OCR should be aware of, we be interested in hearing it).

The question comes down to whether EPA is comfortable relying on those underlying studies about water impacts. Should OCR take your statement below to mean OW would rely on the studies because they appear to be published studies that passed the journal boards' peer reviews?

(FYI, I am not an OEJ attorney, but instead provide legal counsel to the Office of Civil Rights which is investigating the Title VI complaint against NC DEQ related to the issuance of the swine feeding operation general permit.) Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wiedeman, Allison

Sent: Tuesday, May 10, 2016 10:55 AM

To: Wood, Robert <Wood.Robert@epa.gov>; Southerland, Elizabeth <Southerland.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Behl, Betsy <Behl.Betsy@epa.gov>; Flaherty, Colleen

<Flaherty.Colleen@epa.gov>; Hisel-McCoy, Sara <Hisel-McCoy.Sara@epa.gov>; Washington, Evelyn <Washington.Evelyn@epa.gov>; Zipf, Lynn <Zipf.Lynn@epa.gov>; O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>

Cc: Tejada, Matthew <Tejada.Matthew@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

Thanks Rob - I am ccing your email to Mary O'Lone who is the OEJ attorney on this effort to see if this is what she needs.

Allison Wiedeman

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Chief, Rural Branch

Water Permits, Office of Water

Rm 7146 EPA East

Washington, D.C. 20460

202 564 0901

From: Wood, Robert

Sent: Monday, May 09, 2016 4:33 PM

To: Southerland, Elizabeth <Southerland.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Behl, Betsy <Behl.Betsy@epa.gov>; Flaherty, Colleen <Flaherty.Colleen@epa.gov>; Hisel-McCoy, Sara <Hisel-McCoy.Sara@epa.gov>; Washington, Evelyn <Washington.Evelyn@epa.gov>; Zipf, Lynn <Zipf.Lynn@epa.gov>

Cc: Tejada, Matthew <Tejada.Matthew@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

I assume they don't need OST's help reviewing the two listed studies (links below) as these are studies demonstrating the proximity of industrial hog farms (IHOs) to communities with certain demographic and socioeconomic characteristic in NC using census data, but not studies demonstrating health impacts from proximity to IHOs. It sounds instead like they are looking for assistance reviewing the studies from the literature cited in these two studies that report various health impacts from IHOs? Those appear to be published studies so it's not clear why they need scientific support to review studies that appear to be published and peer reviewed. Shouldn't they be accepted if they passed the journal boards' peer reviews? If they do need help reviewing health effects studies, they really need to be more specific about what they want reviewed.

If they do need assistance reviewing the proximity studies, I suggest they consult Matt Tejada, Director OEJ as OEJ may be able to use EJ Screen to replicate the results of the proximity studies. Links to both of the proximity studies listed in Allison's email:

<http://www.ncpolicywatch.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/UNC-Report.pdf>

<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1637958/pdf/envhper00304-0081.pdf>

Robert K. Wood, Director

Engineering and Analysis Division

U.S. EPA Office of Water

202-566-1822

From: Southerland, Elizabeth

Sent: Monday, May 09, 2016 3:28 PM

To: Behl, Betsy <Behl.Betsy@epa.gov>; Flaherty, Colleen <Flaherty.Colleen@epa.gov>; Hisel-McCoy, Sara <Hisel-McCoy.Sara@epa.gov>; Washington, Evelyn <Washington.Evelyn@epa.gov>; Wood, Robert <Wood.Robert@epa.gov>; Zipf, Lynn <Zipf.Lynn@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

Importance: High

Do we have anyone who could help with a review of these studies? I personally cannot think of anyone.

From: Wiedeman, Allison

Sent: Monday, May 09, 2016 3:22 PM

To: Best-Wong, Benita <Best-Wong.Benita@epa.gov>; Evans, David <Evans.David@epa.gov>; Grevatt, Peter <Grevatt.Peter@epa.gov>; Southerland, Elizabeth <Southerland.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>

Subject: need science expertise for review of water impact studies - Title IV complaint

Importance: High

Benita, Peter, and Betsy -

Mike Shapiro has asked us to find expertise within OW to review the various science documents described below in a complaint that our Office of Civil Rights is handling. The case was first sent to us because it is about swine CAFOs. However, we in WPD do not have the expertise to provide a review of some of the studies listed below to determine their scientific validity. Do any of you have someone in your offices that could do that?

From: Dorka, Lilian

Sent: Tuesday, May 03, 2016 10:19 AM

To: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>

Cc: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>; Johnson, Johanna <Johnson.Johanna@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Golightly-Howell, Velveta <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>

Subject: NC DEQ Swine Operation

Importance: High

Hi Mike,

I am following up on Velveta's request for OW's assistance regarding the Title VI complaint OCR accepted for investigation regarding the renewal of NC DEQ's Swine Waste Management General Permit.

As you may know, the complaint attached copies of several studies, referenced but did not provide copies of more studies, and we have come across references to even more studies related to water impacts from swine feeding operations. I have attached a list of these studies.

George Uttig has been very helpful in providing preliminary assistance; however, I am sending you this request to give you a heads up on the more official nature of the request and because of the resource implications. OCR would like OW's assistance

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

OCR has

scheduled witness interviews during the week of May 9. OCR would like to schedule a call as soon as possible to prepare for those interviews and get OW's informal reactions and thoughts about the following attached studies and the underlying studies related to water impacts supporting those studies:

- Steve Wing & Jill Johnston, Dep't of Epidemiology, Univ. of N.C. at Chapel

Hill, *Industrial Hog Operations in North Carolina Disproportionately Impact*

People of Color (2014).

- Steve Wing et al., *Environmental Injustice in North Carolina's Hog Industry*, 108 Env'tl. Health

Perspectives 225, 228 (2000).

Secondly, at a later date, we would also like to discuss the other NC-specific water studies on the attached list as well as any other relevant studies from the attached list or known to OW. More information and/or copies of some of the studies are available on the REACH SharePoint site.

Finally, we are familiar with OW's July 2013 publication, "*Literature Review of Contaminants in Livestock and Poultry Manure and Implications for Water Quality*", but were wondering if there are any other studies or publications not on the attached list concerning CAFOs that OCR should be aware of?

We will contact George to set up the call about the two studies listed above and the underlying studies to prepare for the interviews. Should we continue to work with George as we go down the path of the due weight evaluation?

Thanks so much for your help! Lilian

Lilian S. Dorka

Deputy Director

Office of Civil Rights

Allison Wiedeman

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Chief, Rural Branch

Water Permits, Office of Water

Rm 7146 EPA East

Washington, D.C. 20460

202 564 0901

To: Utting, George[Utting.George@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Mon 4/18/2016 3:27:52 PM
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

I will keep your schedule in mind & look at your calendar.
We need to pull ourselves together & I need to see if I can find Dr. Wing's recent study related to water impacts from swine CAFOs.
I am thinking it will be tomorrow at earliest we'd try to set up a call.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 11:05 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Ok. Just let me now when you want to connect. You can send me an appointment or just email me with a time. I'm part-time teleworking this week and next week. If you give me a heads up, I can be available regardless of the time, assuming no conflicts.

Also, if you think it would be helpful for me to review any information in advance, let me know. I've got one high priority matter I'm working on right now, but I can spend some time preparing for our discussion. If you are just looking for input on Clean Water Act or NPDES issues, then I probably don't need to prepare much.

George

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 10:54 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Great. Likely a little later this afternoon.
Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:53 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Cc: Shapiro, Mike; Wiedeman, Allison; Nagle, Deborah; Brennan, Ross
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Hi Mary.

Please feel free to contact me concerning this matter. I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Wiedeman, Allison
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:20 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Thanks kGeorge - please keep my posted. You might go ahead and contact Mary - Deborah is out this week

Allison Wiedeman
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Chief, Rural Branch
Water Permits, Office of Water
Rm 7146 EPA East
Washington, D.C. 20460
202 564 0901

-----Original Message-----

From: Utting, George

Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 8:07 AM

To: Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>

Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Yes. I am available and can help.

As I recall, we were involved tangentially in this matter as a result of the FOIA we received from Mona Lisa Wallace in February 2015.

Let me know if you would like me to contact Mary. Otherwise, I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George

George Utting

Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)

U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20460-0001

(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Nagle, Deborah

Sent: Sunday, April 17, 2016 5:53 PM

To: Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>

Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

George

I know you are working off site, but can you provide some assistance to Mary O'lonc on the NC title VI complaint in Louis' absence. Please let me know

Deborah

Sent from my iPhone

> On Apr 17, 2016, at 5:34 PM, Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov> wrote:

>

> Deborah,

>

>

> See the note below from Mary O'Lone, who is requesting some assistance in Louis' absence with respect to the North Carolina Title VI complaint. Is there anyone who could provide some short term help over the next few days?

>

>

> Mike

>

>

>

> From: O'Lone, Mary

> Sent: Friday, April 15, 2016 4:46 PM

> To: Shapiro, Mike

> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Golightly-Howell, Velveta; simons.vickie@epa.gov;
> Temple, Kurt; Farrell, Ericka
> Subject: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO
> Complaint
>
>
> Mike-
>
> I was going to email Louis who you'd given Velveta as the OW contact, but I see he is out of the office until next Thursday. We've just been notified today: **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**, the author of the disproportionate impact study Earthjustice submitted in the NC swine CAFO Title VI complaint is **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**. If he is able to speak with OCR, it will likely be in the next two weeks.
>
>
> While Dr. Wing's disproportionate impact study (I have attached it as FYI) is not focused on water issues per se, another recent study he authored (which I don't yet have a copy of) that is discussed in this article is. The article lays out some basic critiques of Dr. Wing's water study by the pork industry.
<http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/pig-poop-fouls-north-carolina-streams/>
>
>
> Is there someone we can speak with in OW early next week to help us
> prepare for the interview. Thanks so much, Mary
>
>
> Mary O'Lone
>
> Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
>
> Office of General Counsel
>
> US EPA
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> (202) 564-4992
>
>
>
> _____
> From: Shapiro, Mike
> Sent: Sunday, March 13, 2016 9:32 PM
> To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Shaw, Betsy; Starfield, Lawrence
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt;
> Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Harrell, Collette; Eby,
> Louis; Nagle, Deborah; Simons, Vicki
> Subject: RE: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)
>
>
> Velveta,
>
>
>
> Louis Eby will serve as the OW POC for this case.

>
>
>
> Mike
>
>
>
>
> Michael Shapiro
>
> Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Water
>
> US EPA, 4101M
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-5700
>
>
>
> From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
> Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:58 AM
> To: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Shapiro, Mike
> <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence
> <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl
> <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>;
> Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise
> <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; O'Lone,
> Mary <o'lone.mary@epa.gov>; Harrell, Collette
> <Harrell.Collette@epa.gov>
> Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)
>
>
>
> Hello Betsy, Mike and Larry. I'm writing to let you know that Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants, has contacted me regarding REACH, the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinstate its investigation. In requesting recommencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:
>
>
>
> "Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled "motion to intervene" in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention."
>

>
>
> FYI, in response to the councils' request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.
>
>
>
> As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Shortly after OCR began the investigation, you provided POCs for your office. We realize that they may have changed. Would you please provide the names of current POCs ASAP and by Friday, 3/18?
>
>
>
> Thank you for your ongoing assistance!
>
>
>
> Velveta
>
>
>
> Velveta Golightly-Howell
>
> Director, Office of Civil Rights
>
> Environmental Protection Agency
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
>
> Mail Code 1201A
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-6685
>
>
> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

Cc: Shapiro, Mike[Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov]; Wiedeman, Allison[Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov]; Nagle, Deborah[Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov]; Brennan, Ross[Brennan.Ross@epa.gov]; Farrell, Ericka[Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov]; Dorka, Lilian[Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov]
To: Utting, George[Utting.George@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Mon 4/18/2016 2:53:58 PM
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Great. Likely a little later this afternoon.
Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:53 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Cc: Shapiro, Mike; Wiedeman, Allison; Nagle, Deborah; Brennan, Ross
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Hi Mary.

Please feel free to contact me concerning this matter. I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Wiedeman, Allison
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:20 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Thanks kGeorge - please keep my posted. You might go ahead and contact Mary - Deborah is out this week

Allison Wiedeman
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Chief, Rural Branch
Water Permits, Office of Water
Rm 7146 EPA East
Washington, D.C. 20460
202 564 0901

-----Original Message-----

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 8:07 AM
To: Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Yes. I am available and can help.

As I recall, we were involved tangentially in this matter as a result of the FOIA we received from Mona Lisa Wallace in February 2015.

Let me know if you would like me to contact Mary. Otherwise, I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington,DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Nagle, Deborah
Sent: Sunday, April 17, 2016 5:53 PM
To: Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

George

I know you are working off site, but can you provide some assistance to Mary O'lonc on the NC title VI complaint in Louis' absence. Please let me know

Deborah

Sent from my iPhone

> On Apr 17, 2016, at 5:34 PM, Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov> wrote:

>

> Deborah,

>

>

> See the note below from Mary O'Lone, who is requesting some assistance in Louis' absence with respect to the North Carolina Title VI complaint. Is there anyone who could o provide some short term help over the next few days?

>

>
> Mike
>
>
>
> _____
> From: O'Lone, Mary
> Sent: Friday, April 15, 2016 4:46 PM
> To: Shapiro, Mike
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Golightly-Howell, Velveta; simons.vickie@epa.gov;
> Temple, Kurt; Farrell, Ericka
> Subject: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO
> Complaint
>
>
> Mike-
>
> I was going to email Louis who you'd given Velveta as the OW contact, but I see he is out of the office until next Thursday. We've just been notified today that **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** the author of the disproportionate impact study Earthjustice submitted in the NC swine CAFO Title VI complaint is **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**. If he is able to speak with OCR, it will likely be in the next two weeks.
>
>
> While Dr. Wing's disproportionate impact study (I have attached it as FYI) is not focused on water issues per se, another recent study he authored (which I don't yet have a copy of) that is discussed in this article is. The article lays out some basic critiques of Dr. Wing's water study by the pork industry.
> <http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/pig-poop-fouls-north-carolina-streams/>
>
>
> Is there someone we can speak with in OW early next week to help us
> prepare for the interview. Thanks so much, Mary
>
>
> Mary O'Lone
>
> Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
>
> Office of General Counsel
>
> US EPA
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> (202) 564-4992
>
>
> _____
> From: Shapiro, Mike
> Sent: Sunday, March 13, 2016 9:32 PM
> To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Shaw, Betsy; Starfield, Lawrence
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt;
> Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Harrell, Collette; Eby,
> Louis; Nagle, Deborah; Simons, Vicki

> Subject: RE: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

>

>

> Velveta,

>

>

>

> Louis Eby will serve as the OW POC for this case.

>

>

>

> Mike

>

>

>

> Michael Shapiro

>

> Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Water

>

> US EPA, 4101M

>

> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

>

> Washington, DC 20460

>

> 202-564-5700

>

>

>

> From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta

> Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:58 AM

> To: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Shapiro, Mike

> <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence

> <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>

> Cc: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl

> <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>;

> Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise

> <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; O'Lone,

> Mary <o'lone.mary@epa.gov>; Harrell, Collette

> <Harrell.Collette@epa.gov>

> Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

>

>

>

> Hello Betsy, Mike and Larry. I'm writing to let you know that Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants, has contacted me regarding REACH, the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinitiate its investigation. In requesting recommencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:

>

>

>

> "Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the

terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled “motion to intervene” in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention.”

>
>
>
> FYI, in response to the councils’ request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.

>
>
>
> As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Shortly after OCR began the investigation, you provided POCs for your office. We realize that they may have changed. Would you please provide the names of current POCs ASAP and by Friday, 3/18?

>
>
>
> Thank you for your ongoing assistance!

>
>
>
> Velveta

>
>
>
> Velveta Golightly-Howell

>
> Director, Office of Civil Rights
>
> Environmental Protection Agency

>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
>
> Mail Code 1201A

>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-6685

>

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Cc: Dorka, Lilian[Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov]; Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; simons.vickie@epa.gov[simons.vickie@epa.gov]; Temple, Kurt[Temple.Kurt@epa.gov]; Farrell, Ericka[Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov]
To: Shapiro, Mike[Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Fri 4/15/2016 8:46:15 PM
Subject: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

.....
>>>>>

Mike-

I was going to email Louis who you'd given Velveta as the OW contact, but I see he is out of the office until next Thursday. We've just been notified today that **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** the author of the disproportionate impact study Earthjustice submitted in the NC swine CAFO Title VI complaint **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** If he is able to speak with OCR, it will likely be in the next two weeks.

While Dr. Wing's disproportionate impact study (I have attached it as FYI) is not focused on water issues per se, another recent study he authored (which I don't yet have a copy of) that is discussed in this article is. The article lays out some basic critiques of Dr. Wing's water study by the pork industry. <http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/pig-poop-fouls-north-carolina-streams/>

Is there someone we can speak with in OW early next week to help us prepare for the interview. Thanks so much, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Shapiro, Mike

Sent: Sunday, March 13, 2016 9:32 PM

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Shaw, Betsy; Starfield, Lawrence

Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt; Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone,

Mary; Harrell, Collette; Eby, Louis; Nagle, Deborah; Simons, Vicki

Subject: RE: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

Velveta,

Louis Eby will serve as the OW POC for this case.

Mike

Michael Shapiro

Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Water

US EPA, 4101M

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-5700

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta

Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:58 AM

To: Shaw, Betsy ; Shapiro, Mike ; Starfield, Lawrence

Cc: Dorka, Lilian ; Covington, Jeryl ; Farrell, Ericka ; Temple, Kurt ; Packard, Elise ; Rhodes, Julia ; O'Lone, Mary ; Harrell, Collette

Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

Hello Betsy, Mike and Larry. I'm writing to let you know that Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants, has contacted me regarding REACH. the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinstate its investigation. In requesting recommencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:

"Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled "motion to intervene" in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention."

FYI, in response to the councils' request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.

As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Shortly after OCR began the investigation, you provided POCs for your office. We realize that they may have changed. Would you please provide the names of current POCs ASAP and by Friday, 3/18?

Thank you for your ongoing assistance!

Velveta

Velveta Golightly-Howell

Director, Office of Civil Rights

Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Mail Code 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-6685

To: O'Lone, Mary[olone.mary@epa.gov]
From: Utting, George
Sent: Mon 4/18/2016 3:05:45 PM
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Ok. Just let me now when you want to connect. You can send me an appointment or just email me with a time. I'm part-time teleworking this week and next week. If you give me a heads up, I can be available regardless of the time, assuming no conflicts.

Also, if you think it would be helpful for me to review any information in advance, let me know. I've got one high priority matter I'm working on right now, but I can spend some time preparing for our discussion. If you are just looking for input on Clean Water Act or NPDES issues, then I probably don't need to prepare much.

George

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 10:54 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Great. Likely a little later this afternoon.
Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:53 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Cc: Shapiro, Mike; Wiedeman, Allison; Nagle, Deborah; Brennan, Ross
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Hi Mary.

Please feel free to contact me concerning this matter. I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Wiedeman, Allison
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:20 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Thanks kGeorge - please keep my posted. You might go ahead and contact Mary - Deborah is out this week

Allison Wiedeman
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Chief, Rural Branch
Water Permits, Office of Water
Rm 7146 EPA East
Washington, D.C. 20460
202 564 0901

-----Original Message-----

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 8:07 AM
To: Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Yes. I am available and can help.

As I recall, we were involved tangentially in this matter as a result of the FOIA we received from Mona Lisa Wallace in February 2015.

Let me know if you would like me to contact Mary. Otherwise, I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Nagle, Deborah
Sent: Sunday, April 17, 2016 5:53 PM

To: Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

George

I know you are working off site, but can you provide some assistance to Mary O'lane on the NC title VI complaint in Louis' absence. Please let me know

Deborah

Sent from my iPhone

> On Apr 17, 2016, at 5:34 PM, Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov> wrote:

>

> Deborah,

>

>

> See the note below from Mary O'Lone, who is requesting some assistance in Louis' absence with respect to the North Carolina Title VI complaint. Is there anyone who could provide some short term help over the next few days?

>

>

> Mike

>

>

>

> From: O'Lone, Mary

> Sent: Friday, April 15, 2016 4:46 PM

> To: Shapiro, Mike

> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Golightly-Howell, Velveta; simons.vickie@epa.gov;

> Temple, Kurt; Farrell, Ericka

> Subject: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO

> Complaint

>

>

> Mike-

>

> I was going to email Louis who you'd given Velveta as the OW contact, but I see he is out of the office until next Thursday. We've just been notified today that Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy the author of the disproportionate impact study Earthjustice submitted in the NC swine CAFO Title VI complaint is

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy If he is able to speak with OCR, it will likely be in the next two weeks.

>

>

> While Dr. Wing's disproportionate impact study (I have attached it as FYI) is not focused on water issues per se, another recent study he authored (which I don't yet have a copy of) that is discussed in this article is. The article lays out some basic critiques of Dr. Wing's water study by the pork industry.

<http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/pig-poop-fouls-north-carolina-streams/>

>

>

> Is there someone we can speak with in OW early next week to help us

> prepare for the interview. Thanks so much, Mary

>

>

> Mary O'Lone
>
> Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
>
> Office of General Counsel
>
> US EPA
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> (202) 564-4992
>
>
>

> From: Shapiro, Mike
> Sent: Sunday, March 13, 2016 9:32 PM
> To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Shaw, Betsy; Starfield, Lawrence
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt;
> Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Harrell, Collette; Eby,
> Louis; Nagle, Deborah; Simons, Vicki
> Subject: RE: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)
>
>
> Velveta,
>
>
>
> Louis Eby will serve as the OW POC for this case.
>
>
>
> Mike
>
>
>
> Michael Shapiro
>
> Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Water
>
> US EPA, 4101M
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-5700
>
>
>
> From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
> Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:58 AM
> To: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Shapiro, Mike
> <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence

> <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl
> <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>;
> Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise
> <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; O'Lone,
> Mary <o'lone.mary@epa.gov>; Harrell, Collette
> <Harrell.Collette@epa.gov>
> Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)
>
>
>
> Hello Betsy, Mike and Larry. I'm writing to let you know that Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants, has contacted me regarding REACH. the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinstate its investigation. In requesting commencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:
>
>
>
> "Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled "motion to intervene" in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention."
>
>
>
> FYI, in response to the councils' request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.
>
>
>
> As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Shortly after OCR began the investigation, you provided POCs for your office. We realize that they may have changed. Would you please provide the names of current POCs ASAP and by Friday, 3/18?
>
>
>
> Thank you for your ongoing assistance!
>
>
>
> Velveta
>
>
>
> Velveta Golightly-Howell
>
> Director, Office of Civil Rights

>
> Environmental Protection Agency
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
>
> Mail Code 1201A
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-6685
>

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

To: O'Lone, Mary[olone.mary@epa.gov]
Cc: Shapiro, Mike[Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov]; Wiedeman, Allison[Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov]; Nagle, Deborah[Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov]; Brennan, Ross[Brennan.Ross@epa.gov]
From: Utting, George
Sent: Mon 4/18/2016 1:53:28 PM
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Hi Mary.

Please feel free to contact me concerning this matter. I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW,
Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Wiedeman, Allison
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 9:20 AM
To: Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>; Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Thanks kGeorge - please keep my posted. You might go ahead and contact Mary - Deborah is out this week

Allison Wiedeman
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Chief, Rural Branch
Water Permits, Office of Water
Rm 7146 EPA East
Washington, D.C. 20460
202 564 0901

-----Original Message-----

From: Utting, George
Sent: Monday, April 18, 2016 8:07 AM
To: Nagle, Deborah <Nagle.Deborah@epa.gov>; Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

Yes. I am available and can help.

As I recall, we were involved tangentially in this matter as a result of the FOIA we received from Mona Lisa Wallace in February 2015.

Let me know if you would like me to contact Mary. Otherwise, I can be reached by email or by phone at

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

George

George Utting
Water Permits Division (MC-4203M)
U.S. EPA, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20460-0001
(202) 564-0744 / Fax (202) 564-6384

-----Original Message-----

From: Nagle, Deborah
Sent: Sunday, April 17, 2016 5:53 PM
To: Brennan, Ross <Brennan.Ross@epa.gov>; Utting, George <Utting.George@epa.gov>
Cc: Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Wiedeman, Allison <Wiedeman.Allison@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO Complaint

George

I know you are working off site, but can you provide some assistance to Mary O'lonc on the NC title VI complaint in Louis' absence. Please let me know

Deborah

Sent from my iPhone

> On Apr 17, 2016, at 5:34 PM, Shapiro, Mike <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov> wrote:
>
> Deborah,
>
>
> See the note below from Mary O'Lone, who is requesting some assistance in Louis' absence with respect to the North Carolina Title VI complaint. Is there anyone who could provide some short term help over the next few days?
>
>
> Mike
>
>
>
> _____
> From: O'Lone, Mary
> Sent: Friday, April 15, 2016 4:46 PM
> To: Shapiro, Mike
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Golightly-Howell, Velveta; simons.vickie@epa.gov;
> Temple, Kurt; Farrell, Ericka
> Subject: Urgent need for OW contact for OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 - CAFO
> Complaint
>
>
> Mike-
>
> I was going to email Louis who you'd given Velveta as the OW contact, but I see he is out of the office until next Thursday. We've just been notified today that Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy the author of the disproportionate impact study Earthjustice submitted in the NC swine CAFO Title VI complaint is Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy If he is able to speak with OCR, it will likely be in the next two weeks.
>
>
> While Dr. Wing's disproportionate impact study (I have attached it as FYI) is not focused on water issues per se, another recent study he authored (which I don't yet have a copy of) that is discussed in this article is.

The article lays out some basic critiques of Dr. Wing's water study by the pork industry.
<http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/pig-poop-fouls-north-carolina-streams/>

>
>
> Is there someone we can speak with in OW early next week to help us
> prepare for the interview. Thanks so much, Mary

>
>
> Mary O'Lone

>
> Civil Rights and Finance Law Office
>
> Office of General Counsel

>
> US EPA
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> (202) 564-4992

>
>
>
>
> _____
> From: Shapiro, Mike
> Sent: Sunday, March 13, 2016 9:32 PM
> To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Shaw, Betsy; Starfield, Lawrence
> Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt;
> Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Harrell, Collette; Eby,
> Louis; Nagle, Deborah; Simons, Vicki
> Subject: RE: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

>
>
> Velveta,
>
>
>
> Louis Eby will serve as the OW POC for this case.

>
>
>
>
> Mike

>
>
>
>
> Michael Shapiro
>
> Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Water

>
> US EPA, 4101M
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>

> 202-564-5700

>

>

>

> From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta

> Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:58 AM

> To: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Shapiro, Mike

> <Shapiro.Mike@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence

> <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>

> Cc: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl

> <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>;

> Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>; Packard, Elise

> <Packard.Elise@epa.gov>; Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; O'Lone,

> Mary <o'lone.mary@epa.gov>; Harrell, Collette

> <Harrell.Collette@epa.gov>

> Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

>

>

>

> Hello Betsy, Mike and Larry. I'm writing to let you know that Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants, has contacted me regarding REACH, the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinstate its investigation. In requesting commencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:

>

>

>

> "Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled "motion to intervene" in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention."

>

>

>

> FYI, in response to the councils' request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.

>

>

>

> As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Shortly after OCR began the investigation, you provided POCs for your office. We realize that they may have changed. Would you please provide the names of current POCs ASAP and by Friday, 3/18?

>

>

>

> Thank you for your ongoing assistance!

>

>

>
> Velveta
>
>
>
> Velveta Golightly-Howell
>
> Director, Office of Civil Rights
>
> Environmental Protection Agency
>
> 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
>
> Mail Code 1201A
>
> Washington, DC 20460
>
> 202-564-6685
>

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

To: O'Lone, Mary[OLone.Mary@epa.gov]
Cc: Tommelleo, Nancy[Tommelleo.Nancy@epa.gov]
From: Tommelleo, Nancy
Sent: Mon 10/3/2016 5:13:16 PM
Subject: RE: REACH - request to set up call with R4 water folks

Mary:

Here is a list of regional folks (15) that would want to participate in the staff level call on what the Region is currently doing in NC if you want to a Calendar Invite. They cover water, Air, EJ, enforcement, some of my legal folks, and OCR. They reflect a combination of staff and managers. My contact for helping set up the VTC (once you decide on date/time) is Angela Cameron (404-562-8492).

Water:

Denise Diaz

Tom McGill

Cesar Zapata

Dan O'lone

Don Joe

Jim Giattina

EJ

Denise Tennessee

Enforcement

Scott Gordon

Air

Carol Kemker

Legal

Nancy Tommelleo

Carol Baschon

Paul Schwartz

Kim A. Jones

OCR

Ken Lapierre

Naima Halim-Chestnut

Also, you may know this, but OAQPS has been doing some emission inventory work in NC. The OAQPS contact for this is Richard (Chet) Wheylan.

Let me know date/times for the VTC.

Thanks

Nancy



Nancy L. Tommelleo

Deputy Regional Counsel

United States Environmental Protection Agency

Region 4

61 Forsyth Street, S.W.

Atlanta, Georgia 30303

tel: 404.562.9571

fax: 404.562.9663

tommelleo.nancy@epa.gov

Confidentiality Notice: This communication is being sent to you by an attorney and is intended only for the individual(s) or entity(s) to whom or to which it is addressed. This communication may contain information that is proprietary, privileged, enforcement confidential, or otherwise legally exempt from disclosure. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by email and delete all copies of this message.

From: O'Lone, Mary

Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 4:28 PM

To: Tommelleo, Nancy <Tommelleo.Nancy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: REACH - request to set up call with R4 water folks

Nancy-

This would be a staff level call b/c we have a bunch of background questions about how & when R4 water folk interact with NC DEQ in the CWA context (*e.g.*, the 303(d) list, review of water quality standards, any petitions to withdraw NC's NPDES program). From here it would be me, Dan Isales, maybe Simma Kupchan and/or Jim Curtin (water attys in OGC who are the NPDES & TMDL experts in the CAFO area I have been talking to), & the 2 OCR people who are working on the investigation (Jeryl Covington & Ericka Farrell).

I mentioned to Lilian that we needed to get her to reach out to Ken to get the bigger picture overview of R4 activities in NC re: CAFOs and/or the communities we are talking about (*e.g.*, EJ activities, enforcement, water stuff too). But I haven't been able to make that happen yet.

Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Tommelleo, Nancy

Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 3:52 PM

To: O'Lone, Mary <OLone.Mary@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: REACH - request to set up call with R4 water folks

Mary: would be on this call from HQ? and is this the call that Lilian wanted to have with our Division Director level people?



Nancy L. Tommelleo

Deputy Regional Counsel

United States Environmental Protection Agency

Region 4

61 Forsyth Street, S.W.

Atlanta, Georgia 30303

tel: 404.562.9571

fax: 404.562.9663

tommelleo.nancy@epa.gov

Confidentiality Notice: This communication is being sent to you by an attorney and is intended only for the individual(s) or entity(s) to whom or to which it is addressed. This communication may contain information that is proprietary, privileged, enforcement confidential, or otherwise legally exempt from disclosure. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by email and delete all copies of this message.

From: O'Lone, Mary

Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 3:00 PM

To: Tommelleo, Nancy <Tommelleo.Nancy@epa.gov>

Cc: Isales, Daniel <Isales.Daniel@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>

Subject: REACH - request to set up call with R4 water folks

Nancy-

Per our conversation a week or so ago, would it be possible to set up a call next week with some combination of your water folks (*e.g.*, Denisse, Dan O., Don) to talk about R4 & CAFOs in NC. We are thinking probably Thursday or Friday. I have been getting tutoring from OGC & HQ folks on the basics of what can & can't be done under the CWA. Most conversations come back to "R4 would know more about this on the ground" or "maybe R4 has done this already."

Also, I don't know if Denisse, Dan, & Don are NPDES-only or also cover drinking water/groundwater issues. If they do both, we'd like to talk about that too. If not, we'd like to set up a separate chat with appropriate R4 folks on drinking water/groundwater too.

Let me know if I should send out and invite & to whom I should send it. Or if you want to set it up. Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

To: Dorka, Lilian[Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov]; Farrell, Ericka[Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]
Cc: Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]; Temple, Kurt[Temple.Kurt@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Tue 3/29/2016 9:24:12 PM
Subject: RE: draft RFI for REACH - please review
REACH draft RFI 3 25 2016 to DOJ with FCS comments.mmo.doc

.....
>>>>>>

I have not dealt with the actual RFI provisions, but the letter has been edited.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Dorka, Lilian
Sent: Tuesday, March 29, 2016 2:53 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary ; Farrell, Ericka ; Covington, Jeryl
Cc: Rhodes, Julia ; Temple, Kurt
Subject: RE: draft RFI for REACH - please review

Thanks. Mary can you please share the latest draft please?

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Tuesday, March 29, 2016 10:52 AM
To: Dorka, Lilian <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>
Cc: Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft RFI for REACH - please review

Purely editorial in the cover letter which I took. They did add a boilerplate paragraph on what a record is, etc. that I also took.

They have added in a handful of questions that mainly focus on:

- getting the types of records we requested for swine CAFOs for other types of CAFOs & CAFO programs (e.g., chickens, turkeys),

- FTEs, allocation of resources among DEQ programs

- Budgets for past 3 years.

Ex. 5 - Atty Client/Deliberative Process

I don't know that we need a meeting or just your call on whether you want the tier 2 questions in there now or for a later request.

I can send a version where I have accepted some stuff & left the other inserts as redline if you want.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Dorka, Lilian

Sent: Monday, March 28, 2016 10:48 PM

To: O'Lone, Mary ; Farrell, Ericka <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>; Covington, Jeryl <Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>

Cc: Rhodes, Julia <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>; Temple, Kurt <Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>

Subject: Fwd: draft RFI for REACH - please review

How do their comments look? Do we need to meet to discuss?

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Neal, Daria (CRT)" <Daria.Neal@usdoj.gov>

Date: March 25, 2016 at 6:54:09 PM EDT

To: "O'Lone, Mary" <o'one.mary@epa.gov>, "Dorka, Lilian" <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>

Cc: "Rhodes, Julia" <Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov>, "Lareau, Alyssa (CRT)" <Alyssa.Lareau@usdoj.gov>, "Goldschmidt, Iris (CRT)" <Iris.Goldschmidt@usdoj.gov>, "Johnson, Johahna" <Johnson.Johahna@epa.gov>, "Temple, Kurt"

<Temple.Kurt@epa.gov>, "Farrell, Ericka" <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>, "Covington, Jeryl"
<Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: draft RFI for REACH - please review

Hello Mary,

Attached are our comments to the RFI. We are available next week to discuss.

Thanks and have a good weekend.

Daria

From: O'Lone, Mary [mailto:o'lane.mary@epa.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, March 22, 2016 8:57 PM

To: Dorka, Lilian; Neal, Daria (CRT)

Cc: Rhodes, Julia; Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Goldschmidt, Iris (CRT); Johnson, Johahna; Temple, Kurt; Farrell, Ericka; Covington, Jeryl

Subject: draft RFI for REACH - please review

Daria-

Ex. 5 - Atty Client/Deliberative Process

Also, we talked about re-initiating our monthly calls with you -- maybe picking a regular date -- like 2nd Thursday of the month. Can you throw out a days of the month & times that look good for you all?

OCR will be working with Earthjustice to set up an interview with Dr. Wing.

I am in San Francisco for the next 2 days **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process** so I will have spotty email access, but as a general matter, my schedule can conform to you & OCR's.

Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992